

**Minutes of the North Carolina Charter School Advisory Board**

**State Board Room 755, Department of Public Instruction**

**November 7, 2022**

**9 AM**

Attendance – CSAB Members	
Jamey Falkenbury (non-voting) Rita Haire John Eldridge Cheryl Turner – Absent Hilda Parlér Shelly Bullard – Arrived 9:13AM	Eric Sanchez Terry Stoops Bruce Friend Dave Machado Todd Godbey – Absent Bartley Danielsen
Attendance – Other	
<i>Office of Charter Schools</i>  Ashley Baquero, Director Joseph Letterio, Consultant Melanie Rackley, Consultant Jenna Cook, Consultant Darian Jones, Consultant – Absent Jay Whalen, NC ACCESS Davida Robinson, NC ACCESS – remote Barbara O’Neal, NC ACCESS Lakisha Robinson, NC ACCESS	<i>Attorney General</i> Forrest Fallanca Zach Padgett  <i>SBE Attorney</i> Allison Schafer – Absent  <i>Teacher/Principal of Year</i> William Storrs Maria Mills – Absent Jeremy White

**Call To Order**

**Pledge of Allegiance: Dr. Stoops**

**Mission and Ethics Statement:**

- Mr. Friend read the Mission and Ethics Statement. Ms. Hilda Parlér recused from Bonnie Cone Classical Academy. Mr. Dave Machado recused from West Lake Preparatory Academy.

**Approval of the Agenda and Minutes**

**Motion: Ms. Parlér** motioned to approve the agenda for the November Meeting

**Seconded By: Dr. Haire**

**Vote: Unanimous**

Passed                      Failed

**Motion: Dr. Eldridge** motioned to approve minutes for October meeting.

**Seconded By: Ms. Parlér**

**Vote: Unanimous**

Passed

Failed

### **November Charter School Advisory Board Meeting**

#### Introduction to November Charter School Application Interviews (Ms. Melanie Rackley)

- Introduction of duties, as well as review of 2022 process thus far.
- Application Summary Feedback discussed.
- Confirmed that December will see second round interviews only. All first round interviews conclude in November.
- Reviewed application process.

#### Movement School West Charlotte

##### Introduction

- Ms. Rackley gave an introduction on the school (located in Mecklenburg County). Stated the number of schools in the region as well as proposed subgroup and demographic data.

##### Opening Remarks

- Mr. Tim Hurley, Board Chair, gave the opening statement. Mr. Hurley spoke in detail about the academic data of the Movement schools and how the schools are outperforming other schools with the economically disadvantaged (EDS) population and the black population.

##### Questions / Discussion

- What areas do board members want to talk about:
  - Ms. Parlér would like to know if they closed on their property.
  - Dr. Stoops would like the saturation issue addressed.
  - Mr. Friend asked how the board is handling the growth from an oversight perspective.
  - Mr. Sanchez has similar questions and wants more understanding on the goals of the applicant.
  - Mr. Sanchez wants to discuss the achievement data and where it is going.
  - Mr. Machado wants to know the rationale for opening K-1. He would also like more information about the financial management of the schools.
  - Mr. Machado would like more information about any examples of collaboration with CMS.
  - Dr. Haire would like the applicants to speak to the deep budget on the administrative side for a K-1 school. She would like more information about the board members' experience with Movement Schools and the foundation because they do not appear to represent the local community.
  - Dr. Haire also wanted to know the lunch plans as the application seemed to say that food would come from Charlotte for the Raleigh school as well.
  - Dr. Stoops would also like the applicant to speak to the issues with declining student population in the area.
- Mr. Tim Hurley stated that they have not closed, and they are behind their schedule but well within ability to execute. He stated the contingency would be to open out of the Movement Freedom Drive campus that is three miles away.

- Mr. Hurley stated that there are 7600 (15% of all Mecklenburg students) black students enrolled in charter schools currently. He stated that figure is declining, so there are not enough great options for families in the area, especially when you consider access. He stated that is why they provide busing and free lunch programming.
- Mr. Friend asked how far this school would be from the other Movement schools. Mr. Hurley referenced a map and stated they are all approximately three miles apart and that the majority of students are within a two mile radius. He stated that their model is to have closely located schools in densely populated areas.
- Ms. Thomas spoke about the benefits of closely located schools because you can shift the talent as needed.
- Mr. Hurley stated they aspire to become a charter management organization (CMO). He stated that now they are simply a 501(c)3. He stated that they are working with attorneys to figure out the best model for this. He stated they absolutely want to be nonprofit.
- He stated Movement Freedom has over 1 million in fund balance. He stated they are pouring money into schools but not taking anything from the schools.
- He stated they work with outside vendors as much as possible to ensure that they are able run the schools properly but focus on the academics.
- Ms. Thomas stated that teachers are not moved around often, but if there is a need, they speak with teachers and we find that teachers are open to this because they are invested in the program and understand it from the beginning. She stated they are invested in the why.
- Mr. Hurley stated this is not a replication because every year they are evolving and learning so much each year.
- Mr. Hurley stated they are very fortunate to have the opening budget they have, which is only a possibility because of the Movement Foundation. He stated that the Foundation builds and provides a fully equipped building to the school, rent free for two years. He stated after that it slowly builds for no more than 600k per month and never above market value. He stated the Movement Foundation also provides a grant for the schools and allows the schools to stack the odds in favor of success.
- Dr. Haire asked about the salaries for administration as opposed to classroom technology. Mr. Hurley clarified that the Movement Foundation provides the equipment and technology so they can invest in their people.
- Mr. Machado asked if the audits are in. Mr. Hurley stated they are working on those right now and have a five year history of clean audits.
- Mr. Hurley spoke about learning how to handle transportation with their target demographics. He stated that going forward they will post bus routes during enrollment, not wait for the students to determine the routes.
- Mr. Hurley confirmed that they do not have current plans to go above elementary school. Mr. Sanchez questioned the goals of the school. Ms. Thomas stated that the goals are based on their current data and being realistic about where they currently are. She stated goals for students that have been with the school for longer, have higher set goals of proficiency.
- Mr. Sanchez stated that research suggests that students need at least three years of great teaching to close gaps. He stated he is surprised that they do not want to move onto middle and high school. Ms. Thomas stated they are learning and they want to get the elementary model where it needs to be. Mr. Hurley stated they are also looking into charters to partner with for middle and high school articulation agreements.

- Dr. Danielsen stated they appear to have a model that works but are also refining. He wonders how much growth is that in total for Movement Schools. Mr. Hurley stated they have 1200 students and this would bring them to 375 additional students in launch year. He stated the growth starts small and they are scaling up with support as they go.

#### Closing Statement

- Mr. Hurley brought attention to the schools in the area and their belief that they have the ability to bring

#### Deliberation

- Mr. Friend stated he is not sure how this is not a replication. He wondered if commingling of funds between schools occurs.
- Dr. Haire stated they are passionate and invested and are seeing success. She stated she believes they have enough knowledge about budgets that they could be trusted with that. She stated that everything looks very deliberately thought out. She stated they are reaching a population with that schools and teachers are struggling with brining success. She stated that her issue is with the board. She stated that this is different than most boards which come before CSAB.
- Mr. Hurley confirmed that the school board is different than the foundation board.
- Dr. Eldridge stated it is not clear in his head, the organizational structure.
- Mr. Sanchez stated that the invoicing between schools shouldn't be an issue – they are buying the same product (staff, for example) and invoice each separately. He stated he believes this model is something that is showing positive results and he believes other profitable companies should look into how you can create a nonprofit and invest in schools. He would encourage them to continue to think about middle and high school because that is more than half of their schooling.
- Dr. Stoops stated he thinks about the difficulty in the Charlotte Mecklenburg schools where they can't find a Superintendent to stay for more than a few years and has not shown itself to be a standard bearer of stability.
- Mr. Machado stated this is not a replication because they wouldn't meet those statutory requirements. He stated that having several smaller schools is a better model than expanding into large schools. He stated that a good accountant should be able to handle the funds easily without commingling and instead they have the economies of scale to help.
- Dr. Bullard stated that you can't argue with the data. She stated what they are doing is clearly working.
- Dr. Danielsen stated he won't jump on the middle/high school bandwagon because it may make sense to move slowly and smaller and then partner with middle/high schools. He stated sometimes speed is the enemy of getting it right. He appreciates the caution they are showing.

#### Movement School Raleigh

##### Introduction

- Ms. Rackley gave an introduction on the school (located in Wake County). Stated the number of schools in the region as well as proposed subgroup and demographic data.

##### Opening Remarks

- Mr. Tim Hurley gave an overview of Wake County data and specifically the performance of black students in Wake County. He stated he believes that Movement Schools could bring a benefit to historically black areas of the county.
- He spoke about their work to prepare to expanding to Raleigh. He stated they would add two Raleigh based board members and alternate meetings between Charlotte and Raleigh. He stated he has put a lot of effort into building a Raleigh education advisory board. He stated members include representatives from YMCA, United Way, National State Caucus of Black Legislators, and National Association of Medical Minority Educators. Mr. Hurley stated these advisory members would help build connections within the community.
- He stated that there continues to be a real market for charters serving black students. He stated that most of the charters are not serving high numbers of EDS in Wake County.
- Ms. Thomas spoke about addressing fears people may have about expanding to Wake County. She stated they have many staff already interested in moving to Raleigh. She stated she would be in Raleigh as much as necessary.

#### Questions/Discussion

- Ms. Parlér asked about family chats and would like more information.
- Mr. Machado would like more information about the board members and board governance.
- Mr. Falkenbury would like to know why advisory board members are not on the actual board.
- Dr. Haire would like to know the board term information.
  - Mr. Hurley stated they have been very deliberate in their growth and is why they haven't structured as a management organization yet. He stated NC makes it even more complicated because of the existence of Charter Support Organizations which can look very similar. He explained the structures currently:
    - Movement Mortgage – private company
    - Movement Foundation – nonprofit that helps fund the Movement Schools, funded by the profits of Movement Mortgage
    - He stated that all profits from the mortgage company, flow to the Foundation and another nonprofit. He stated that the board members of the Foundation are not the same as the school governing board. He stated that many of the members have relations to the Foundation but they are not dying on that hill and open to change if requested.
    - He stated there is one board meeting for all schools with separate agenda items for each school.
- Ms. Thomas stated that the chat goals are for families to understand who Movement Schools are, what they believe and to hear the same from families. Most families find these very helpful in enrolling students. Ms. Thomas stated they are in-person.
- Mr. Sanchez asked what is the long term goal. Mr. Hurley stated they believe that five schools in an area is a goal. Dr. Stoops asked if the growth of the area is the primary indicator of needing Movement Schools. He stated there are areas in NC which are really in need of this type of school. He wondered if growth and population and if they would consider rural areas. Mr. Hurley stated the primary driver is us being able to fulfill our model and deliver our promises. He stated he is not sure they could make the model work right now in rural areas. He stated he believes that could work when they are larger and stronger.
- Ms. Rackley confirmed there was no impact statement submitted from Wake County.

- Mr. Friend asked about recruitment and marketing. Mr. Hurley responded with survey data from Raleigh families.
- Mr. Eldridge stated that this year Wake County was 400 teachers understaffed at the beginning of the year. He stated they pay one of the highest supplements in the school year. He wondered how they will find teachers.
- Mr. Hurley stated they invest a lot in having a strong brand and invest in teachers. He stated they pay higher than the county salary rate in CMS and are looking to increase that more. He stated that good teachers want to follow good leaders. Ms. Thomas stated that because they start so small, they don't need to recruit large numbers of teachers.
- Mr. Hurley and Ms. Thomas spoke about how they fund special teachers and 'elective period' teachers. Ms. Thomas stated that funding these special elective period teachers was less strain on the budget.
- Mr. Eldridge asked about C4 counseling. Ms. Thomas stated that it is a national organization and provide social workers, therapists, etc. based on specific needs. She stated they are trauma informed and deploy members out to schools. Mr. Hurley stated they were founded in Charlotte and they are growing in conjunction with Movement Schools and it is a local black owned business.
- Mr. Sanchez asked what are the central office staff. Mr. Hurley stated Director of Compliance, Director of Recruitment, and Charlotte Superintendent. He stated they would grow with a Chief Operating Officer and Director of Finance. He stated they want to keep the center as lean as possible and instead focus on the schools.
- Mr. Machado asked if each individual school receives 400k in seed money from the foundation. Mr. Hurley stated each individual school.
- Mr. Hurley stated that there is no commingling of funds and they split costs but that is why they want to create the central organization to help with that complexity.
- Dr. Haire asked about the facility. Mr. Hurley stated they are behind on the goals in the application but they are working on this process.
- Dr. Stoops asked about the food programming. Mr. Hurley stated that was an error in the application – food will not travel from Charlotte – instead, they partner with a food provider in Raleigh.

#### Closing Statement

- Mr. Hurley gave the time back to the board.

#### Deliberation

- Dr. Danielsen stated he praised the County for not objecting to an application such as this serving low income black students.
- Dr. Haire stated that the initial funding from Movement Foundation will resolve her questions about the budgeting.
- Dr. Eldridge stated he is feeling much better about this after speaking to the board.
- Dr. Danielsen stated that the foundation has 100 million or so to invest. He stated that he would prefer they invest that money in NC as opposed to the many other states in the Southeast that would like that type of investment.
- Mr. Hurley stated they are looking to locate in Georgia and they have been approached by other states.

- Mr. Friend wondered if there was a priority among the applicant in terms of these three applications.
- Mr. Sanchez stated that is a valid question and that keeping central lean will be a factor when expanding into different places or other states.

## **ADJOURN FOR LUNCH UNTIL 12:15PM**

### Movement School Northeast Charlotte

#### Introduction

- Ms. Rackley gave an introduction on the school (located in Mecklenburg County). Stated the number of schools in the region as well as proposed subgroup and demographic data.

#### Opening Remarks

- Mr. Hurley stated this would be Movement Schools moving out toward the perimeter of the county as many families are priced out of the area.
- Ms. Thomas spoke about the Superintendent's role and the fact that she has the capacity to manage these campuses as if all three are approved, there is still only 1600 students.
- Mr. Hurley stated they are getting ahead of the growth with plans to hire a Chief Operating Officer and Chief Financial Officer.
- He stated they are trying to plan very small seeds – a total of 375 students. He stated this is the appropriate time for aggressive action given the impact of the pandemic.

#### Questions/Discussion

- Dr. Stoops would like to know the duties of the Superintendent.
  - Ms. Thomas replied: directly manages the principals, align decisions to network priorities, work along chief staff to oversee overall operations, attend board meetings, and with the PreK directors.
  - Dr. Eldridge asked how long the contracts are written for. Ms. Thomas stated one year and they hope to get more
  - Mr. Machado asked who oversees the Superintendent. Ms. Thomas replied, I do.
- Dr. Haire would like to know board membership plans for this area of Charlotte.
  - Mr. Hurley stated they have members from the Charlotte community, and it is not far from the existing members, but they are thinking more about how to use advisory boards and parent committees.
- Dr. Eldridge asked for how the organizational structure would change when it becomes a CMO.
- Mr. Machado wanted to know more about innovation of the Movement Schools.
  - Ms. Thomas stated the model is aimed at closing gaps for the target demographic. She stated the financial literacy component is innovative.
  - Ms. Thomas spoke about the coaching and teaching models.
- Mr. Friend asked for a facility update. Mr. Hurley stated they are trying to stay within their model and are looking for off-market deals now that construction is about 30% above what the costs were last year. They have the resources to go above the initial budget but they think they have a

little more time to find something better. They are trying to keep that 3-mile buffer to prevent enrollment issues in both schools in Charlotte. Dr. Haire and Mr. Hurley had a conversation about targets for finalizing property and purchases.

- Dr. Danielsen asked if limiting the grade levels at the K-1 to start helps with school culture. Ms. Thomas stated yes. She stated it helps get them on a strong footing and that about 85% come in with gaps so they aim to close those gaps early.
- Mr. Hurley stated that they often debate the fact that starting bigger would help financially, but Ms. Thomas stated that they are very lucky to have the financial benefit of the foundation and are able to give the students what they need without worrying about the financials.
- Mr. Sanchez asked how many schools if these are approved. Ms. Thomas stated five elementaries and one middle school.
- Mr. Machado asked if all elementary schools feed into the middle school. Ms. Thomas stated yes, but they would need to increase capacity as the elementary schools increase.

#### Closing Statement

- Mr. Hurley gave the time back to the board.

#### Deliberation

- Dr. Haire stated there is much in the application they didn't discuss such as the curriculum, cultural relevant curriculum.

#### **Motions for Movement School application**

##### Movement School West Charlotte

**Motion: Ms. Parlér** moves to forward application with recommendation for approval.

**Seconded By: Mr. Sanchez**

**Vote: Unanimous (TS, BF, JE, RH, HP, SB, ES, DM, BD)**

Passed                      Failed

##### Movement School Raleigh

**Motion: Mr. Sanchez** moves to forward application with recommendation for approval.

**Seconded By: Dr. Stoops**

##### Discussion:

- Mr. Machado and Dr. Eldridge stated they had concerns about capacity of the board, but the interview has alleviated those concerns.
- Mr. Falkenbury stated he agrees and is very impressed with the advisory board and hopes some join the governing board.
- Mr. Friend agreed.

**Vote: Unanimous (TS, BF, JE, RH, HP, SB, ES, DM, BD)**

Passed                      Failed

##### Movement School Northeast Charlotte

**Motion: Dr. Stoops** moves to forward application with recommendation for approval.

**Seconded By: Dr. Bullard**

Discussion:

- Mr. Sanchez: if they come back down the road, he will want to see more information on the current students and how they are doing. He stated this could really open doors for how private corporations could use profit to benefit public education.

**Vote: Unanimous (TS, BF, JE, RH, HP, SB, ES, DM, BD)**

**Passed**

**Failed**

Mr. Eldridge praised the applicant for their presentation.

Renewals 2023

- Mrs. Jenna Cook, OCS Consultant, introduced the 2023 Renewals Cohort. She talked about when each school would present to the board and when the board would vote on the applications.
- Ms. Cook outlined the renewal guidelines for all categories of renewal and talked about academic comparability data over the last 3 years. She also talked about the process of the interviews for all types of renewals.
  - Mr. Friend asked for clarification on whether CSAB was saying the schools fit certain renewal categories or if it was an evaluation and placement based on a rubric. Ms. Cook said it was the latter, but CSAB would make the official recommendation based on the rubric. Mr. Friend clarified, asking if we are just accepting the recommendations. Ms. Cook and Ms. Baquero answered his clarification stating that it was statutory, and that all data reviewed was prior to the January reports on finances and other data.
  - Dr. Haire\* asked if they are voting individually on schools. Ms. Baquero stated what the board normally did in terms of past voting.
  - Dr. Stoops asked about the legislation/statutory requirements. Ms. Baquero clarified what each placement was (policy or statute) and stated that they were guidelines and not requirements. Mr. Friend said that “– in essence – you either ‘qualify as 10-year or you don’t, and we have the prerogative to put those other schools in the other groupings based on what the data shows”. Ms. Baquero stated that there are so many 3-year’s due to the fact there is so much missing data due to COVID and new grades starting to test.
- Mr. Machado asked ‘if there’s no placement for a non-renewal”? Ms. Cook responded there’s a non-renew on the guidelines. His second question was if any school fell into that category to which Ms. Cook said there were 2. Mr. Machado asked if they have a school at 7-year, can we recommend for 10-year. Ms. Cook outlined the potential way this could happen.
- Mr. Falkenbury asked when they would bring up recommendations on changing the ‘ranking’ of the schools. Ms. Baquero stated that they could do so during the vote / during the interview.
- Mr. Eldridge asked why all the votes were in January, Ms. Baquero responded that this was because they wouldn’t receive all the data until January.
- Mr. Friend gave a hypothetical about a potential scenario that may occur during the interview. Ms. Baquero affirmed that those discussions about personal beliefs on a school can happen between the board members.
- Mr. Falkenbury asked a follow-up question asking if we just state our opinions on the school (if they should be a 7 or be a 5, etc.) and they would record it down in session so everyone knows

that they are thinking a certain way. Mr. Eldridge agreed that it was necessary to help understand what everyone was thinking about.

- Mr. Sanchez asked if there was a risk for the board if we voted on it prior to getting that data. Ms. Baquero responded that it was what School Business wanted to do and it would be easier on all of us to just do it all in the end.
- Dr. Danielsen asked if the guidelines have to all be checked in order to get a ranking or if only 1 needs to be checked, etc. Ms. Baquero and Ms. Cook said that not all 4 need to be checked, but based on internal reviews there were multiple boxes checked in each category. Why it's important CSAB has final review on it.
- Mr. Eldridge asked how many times CSAB has moved a school outside of where it was recommended. Ms. Baquero mentioned that Mr. Machado might know more about schools in the past, but she believes there is always 1. Mr. Machado gave an example of a school moving from 5-7 year renewals after presentation.
- Ms. Cook went over the guidelines for each renewal (10, 7, 5, 3, and non-renewal). She also went over each of the schools in each category. Presentations included school performance grades and other accountability data.
  - Mr. Friend re-iterated that the 10-year schools fit the statutory requirements of the 10-year renewal and so regardless if they came in or not, there's nothing they could change about it. Dr. Haire said that if they fit the 'low-performing school' category than they need to be brought back in.
  - Dr. Stoops and Dr. Haire conversed about the Low Performing Schools
  - Mr. Sanchez thought there was some level of discretion over all of these. Ms. Baquero clarified it was only the 10 year where CSAB didn't have discretion.
  - Dr. Haire asked about no compliance issues and asked about the comparison to the LEA. Ms. Baquero and Ms. Cook clarified that for her.
  - Several Board Members and Ms. Baquero talked about the requirements that Low-Performing Schools needed to go through and the fact that they already come in front of the board to discuss their plan. Some board members had issues with the number of schools coming in and Ms. Baquero clarified that we normally don't interview the 10-year renewals because of this concern.
  - Mr. Sanchez asked if we are doing the analysis with schools based on academic performance and stated his opinion on low-performing schools being not critiqued. Ms. Baquero said it would be up to the board.
  - Several Board members and Ms. Baquero went over the Statute and what data CSAB uses to evaluate each school as well as each category again. Several Board Members gave hypotheticals and discussed whether it fits the statutory requirements. In the end, board resolved that they will bring these schools in during the low-performing schools session.
- Ascend Leadership Academy
  - Mr. Damian Perez gave an overview of his board and also touched on his school's performance and academic data. He also touched on plans and goals for the future.
  - Mr. Friend asked if he's cool with 7 years and Mr. Perez said he is.
  - Ms. Parler wants to see the data and Mr. Perez mentioned where they could find the data (but it wasn't in front of the microphone).
- East Voyager Academy
  - Ms. Cook introduced the school.
  - The principal introduced his school and introduced his board. He touched on school performance data and their academic data.

- Dr. Danielsen asked about the Chinese language requirement and asked about the percentages of non Asian students.
  - Dr. Dudd and his board mentioned that it was important to provide this service to those who wished to have it and the majority of the school is non Asian.
- Ms. Cook mentioned the 5-year renewal guidelines. She stated that there was no really good place to put them due to lack of data and it required significant discussions in the future.
  - Dr. Danielsen asked for the difference between 5- and 7-year renewal.
    - Ms. Cook mentioned that the only difference is they are not currently listed as continually low performing and has exceeded growth.
- West Lake Preparatory Academy --> Lincoln County
  - Jennifer Wilson gave an overview of her board and touched on her school's academic data, performance data, school grades and more.
  - Dr. Stoops asked about the enrollment data and Mr. Falkenbury asked if all the compliance stuff has been cleared up. Ms. Wilson stated that they have cleared up compliance issues and touched on the number of EDS students compared to when they started.
  - Mr. Falkenbury thinks it should be a seven year term but because of COVID there is a lack of data. Will advocate for it to be a seven year.
  - Dr. Haire asked if increased enrollment was due to adding grade levels. Ms. Wilson added that it was due to adding grades but also that they moved to a new building. Also noted that it was scheduled for an EC visit but that has not happened. She and Mr. Falkenbury went over the 1 compliance issue that their application listed.
- Bonnie Cone Classical Academy
  - Ms. Cook gave an overview of the school and their data. Mr. McCarthy introduced his school and his school's data. He asked to be considered for a 7 year renewal. The principal was presented the school's data on performance, growth, and more.
  - Dr. Stoops was astonished of the 430 students and a C performance grade the next year after a global pandemic began. A board member stated that they also gave parents the opportunity to come back in person and because of this they recommend a 7-year.
  - Mr. Machado lauded the school on their diversity of population in an affluent area. Mr. Friend agreed.
  - Mr. Falkenbury re-iterated the support parents had for that in-person instruction and the growth they achieved.
- Jackson Day School
  - Ms. Cook introduced the school, gave an overview and where they were. Ms. Tammy Winstead gave a presentation of the academic data, school performance data, and challenges facing the students at the school.
  - Mr. Machado asked what low scores in the beginning was attributed to. Ms. Winstead attributed that to the large influx in students and COVID. Also mentioned that the budget was carried over mostly from the Charter School after Mr. Machado congratulated the school on it. Ms. Winstead also lauded the board who helped her with it.
  - Mr. Machado asked about the 100+ people brought in each year; and Ms. Winstead outlined the planning behind growing at that pace.
  - Mr. Friend mentioned the requirements for 5- and 7-year renewals and Ms. Winstead said she'd like to be higher. She stated what was also limiting growth but was glad that they were back at the place where they began.

- Mr. Eldridge asked about the retention rates of 90 and 92%. Ms. Winstead attributed that to the administrative team and focus on the students. Ms. Winstead also talked about outreach to parents and students.

**Motion: Ms. Parlér** motioned to adjourn at 3:40PM

**Seconded By: Mr. Friend**

**Vote: Unanimous**

**Passed**

**Failed**

**Minutes of the North Carolina Charter School Advisory Board**  
**State Board Room 755, Department of Public Instruction**  
**November 8, 2022**  
**9 AM**

Attendance – CSAB Members	
Jamey Falkenbury (non-voting) – Absent Rita Haire John Eldridge Cheryl Turner – Absent Hilda Parlér – Absent Shelly Bullard	Eric Sanchez – Absent Terry Stoops Bruce Friend Dave Machado Todd Godbey – Absent Bartley Danielsen – Absent
Attendance – Other	
<i>Office of Charter Schools</i>  Ashley Baquero, Director Joseph Letterio, Consultant Melanie Rackley, Consultant Jenna Cook, Consultant Darian Jones, Consultant – absent Jay Whalen, NC ACCESS – absent Davida Robinson, NC ACCESS – remote Barbara O’Neal, NC ACCESS – remote Lakisha Robinson, NC ACCESS – absent	<i>Attorney General</i> Zach Padgett  <i>SBE Attorney</i> Allison Schafer – Absent  <i>Teacher/Principal of Year</i> William Storrs – Absent Maria Mills – Absent Jeremy White – Absent

**Call To Order**

**Pledge of Allegiance: Dr. Haire**

**Mission and Ethics Statement:**

- Mr. Friend read the Mission and Ethics Statement.

**November Charter School Advisory Board Meeting**

Amendment (Ms. Ashley Baquero)

- Ms. Baquero explained the amendment request from Aspire Trade High School. The school is planning to open with 9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> grade next fall. The school has a trade/CTE model as its core programming. Ms. Baquero explained they have set a goal of 30% economically disadvantaged student population and plan to implement this weighted lottery, if approved, in the upcoming enrollment and lottery season.

**Motion:** Dr. Eldridge motioned to approve the amendment.

**Seconded By:** Mr. Friend

**Vote:** Unanimous (TS, JE, SB, DM, BF, RH)

Passed                      Failed

Introduction to October Charter School Application Interviews (Ms. Melanie Rackley)

- Ms. Rackley reviewed the applications coming forward today and the time allotted to each interview.

Heritage Collegiate Leadership Academy of Wake County

Introduction

- Ms. Rackley gave an introduction on the school (located in Wake County). Stated the number of schools in the region as well as proposed subgroup and demographic data.

Opening Remarks

- Dr. Kashi Bazemore gave the opening statement. She spoke about the need to serve black and brown students in Wake County. Accompanying board members Dr. Dunn and Dr. Poole introduced themselves. Mrs. Mildred Bazemore, Board Advisor, introduced herself.

Questions / Discussion

- Dr. Bullard would like to hear about the “culture camp” referenced in the application. She would like to know what makes the school different and innovative.
- Mr. Friend would like to know what is different from Wake County in response to the LEA impact statement. He would like to know what has changed from the previous application. He would like to know more about incorporating mindfulness into the curriculum as referenced in the application.
  - Dr. Bazemore stated that HCLA has an unwavering focus on efficacy. She stated they start with making sure scholars know we believe in them. She stated they have shown this is possible. Dr. Bazemore stated that although they closed in 2018, many of their students are in early colleges and doing well. She stated she has kept in touch with families
  - Dr. Bazemore stated that the record should reflect that the school was not revoked but assumed. She stated that she helped Mr. Don McQueen get that charter and to make sure they were ready before they came before CSAB and SBE. She stated she believes that students of color need to see teachers and leaders of color.
  - Dr. Bazemore stated the assuming school did not perform as well as they did when they ran HCLA Bertie. She stated you must focus on growth and they were on their way but did not have the time to show what was possible.

- She stated there were mistakes made but they learned from those mistakes. She stated they are stronger and more clear than ever.
- Mr. Friend would also like to know more about the facility costs referenced in the budget which seem exceedingly low.
- Mr. Friend would like to know if there is carry over on the board from the Bertie school.
  - Dr. Bazemore stated no current board members were board members of that school. She stated that Dr. Dunn was the director of curriculum during last year of operation. She stated Dr. Poole came to do parent trainings but was not working with the school. She stated that Mr. Bond was hired as a temporary employee the last two years during his off season a few months of the year. Mrs. Bazemore was the testing coordinator. Dr. Bazemore was the Executive Director.
- Dr. Haire would like to know if the HCLA of Wake County is a legal nonprofit, as the documentation shows past tax exempt information for HCLA of Bertie County.
  - Dr. Kashi Bazemore just needs to get a \$25 name change for the nonprofit. She stated she just needs to do that.
- Dr. Haire would like to know what evidence the board has of parent interest.
  - Dr. Bazemore stated she has several pages.
- Dr. Haire would like the applicant to speak to the technology budget and curriculum budget.
- Dr. Stoops would like to know why the aggressive ADM at year one at over 400 students and how the applicant will recruit students and teachers in an incredibly competitive staffing market.
  - Dr. Bazemore stated they have the budget to recruit and will use a marketing firm but believe it must be personal – going to churches, etc. She stated Wake County has five alternative schools. She stated that she has talked to families from the former Torchlight.
  - She stated that the diversity office of Wake County is not doing anything to help marginalized students. She stated she has nothing but respect but she genuine concern after looking at the County data.
- Dr. Bazemore spoke about the Maxwell program and executive functioning instruction they plan. She stated that positive culture is important.
- Dr. Bazemore stated they have partnerships with Bertie County for recruitment and also she has reached out to alumni networks at the schools she has attended.
- Dr. Eldridge would like the board to address the statement from Wake County that the former school was closed due to mismanagement and student achievement.
- Dr. Bazemore stated they have learned how to be in connection with the DPI staff and they have a positive working relationship with the Office of Charter Schools. She stated when she hears Wake County talking about performance, that is the pot calling the kettle black. She spoke about the number of Wake County schools with Ds and Fs. She spoke about the shifting and movement of students and miserable teachers. She stated she knows that you must work well with the state and that is the number one change.
- Mr. Friend asked why the school was assumed. Dr. Bazemore stated she is still confused about that. She stated that when they ran into governance problems, she stated that some folks were afraid of their businesses and board members resigned when there were issues with the state. She stated the board ended up being very committed but not experienced. She stated their board is much stronger now.
- Dr. Eldridge asked if the leader has been chosen. Dr. Bazemore stated she will be the school leader.

- Dr. Haire asked for the board to speak to the bylaws section about the compensation section. Dr. Bazemore stated that no board member is ever compensated but they need to revisit their bylaws.
- Dr. Bullard asked how the board will change when she is leader. Dr. Bazemore stated that she is founding board but then during the planning year they would transition and she would step off the board.

#### Closing Statement

- Dr. Poole stated he saw patients with ADHD, autism, and mental health issues and found he needed teachers because teachers didn't know how to teach these kids. He couldn't believe the number of parents that would come to his talks in Bertie County because no one is taught how to handle these kids. He stated this is not taught in the school system.
- Dr. Poole stated that is where he saw he could help create something different.
- Dr. Bazemore stated she has autism and ADHD so this is personal. She stated when parents understand they will and can serve these populations, they will come. She stated that they did a lot of good things in Bertie that weren't publicized.

#### Deliberation

- Dr. Haire stated she agrees the board is accomplished and dedicated and that Wake County is in need of great choice.
- She stated there is a lot of reference to alternative schools but they didn't apply as an alternative school so that raises concerns. Her question is about follow through and details. She stated the Articles of Incorporation are ten years old and although Dr. Bazemore stated this can be done, it hasn't been done. She stated the evidence of interest was not provided. She stated she has concerns about the budget that were not discussed.
- Dr. Eldridge stated he believes that they referenced alternative schools because they want to take a different approach, so kids don't end up in alternative schools.
- Mr. Friend stated he is still struggling with the idea of true innovation. He wanted to know more about the mindfulness component. He stated that the salaries in the budget are really low and very difficult to compete in the County. He stated the positions are right, but the salaries are not.
- Mr. Friend stated the bylaws would definitely need to be changed.
- Mr. Friend stated he still has major questions about the facility and how to get one for the amount listed in the application.
- Dr. Bullard stated she believes in their dedication but not convinced with the innovative factor.
- Mr. Machado was intrigued by the information from Dr. Poole about exercise and other health factors.

**Motion: Mr. Friend** moves to forward application to a second interview.

**Seconded By: Dr. Stoops**

#### Discussion

- Ms. Baquero stated that any second round questions and supplemental information will be allowed in response to the CSAB during second round.

**Unanimous (TS, JE, SB, DM, BF, RH)**

Passed

Failed

## Agape Achievement Academy

### Introduction

- Ms. Rackley gave an introduction on the school (located in Cumberland County). Stated the number of schools in the region as well as proposed subgroup and demographic data.

### Opening Remarks

- Mr. Leon Dantzler gave the opening remarks. He introduced the school's mission and board members. Ms. Doris Taylor, Board Chair, stated that they can answer three questions – why should they be approved? She stated that Agape will be the only charter school in the area for grades K-5. She stated they are confident they can hire a strong staff and that all students can grow academically. She stated they intend to leave no child behind. What will we do that the local LEA does not? She spoke about charter education and smaller class sizes.
- Ms. Taylor continued to explain the uniqueness of their program.
- What do we offer differently, she asked. She stated the main goal will hinge on cultural awareness and academic performance. She stated the school day and calendar will be longer.
- She asked why is it needed? She spoke about the local performance scores. She spoke about parent interest.
- Ms. Stephanie Walsh spoke about how they will not leave any child behind.

### Questions/Discussion

- Dr. Eldridge asked the applicant to explain how the social emotional component is accounted for in the budget with no nurse, counselor, social worker.
  - Ms. Taylor stated they will have staff development and will have people come into the school to train staff.
- Dr. Eldridge asked the applicant to respond to the LEA impact statement, especially in terms of the county stating they are already doing all of this.
  - Ms. Taylor stated the size is an advantage, having fewer students. She stated social emotional learning will be a plus.
- Mr. Friend asked what social emotional curriculum will be used and who is in charge of implementation.
- Mr. Friend would like to know more about what community support exists. He would also like to know facility plans.
- Dr. Haire would like to know how the former board has changed to the current board.
  - Ms. Taylor wasn't sure at first but then stated she did serve on that board.
  - Ms. Taylor confirmed she is a pastor.
- Dr. Haire would like to know how the school is implementing a classical education, which is referenced in the application and the mission statement.
  - Ms. Taylor stated they want the students to be participants in their learning.
- Dr. Stoops wonders why there are only two charter schools in the county.
  - Ms. Taylor doesn't know why that is the case. She stated that they have wanted to do this for a long time. She stated they chose the area they are targeting because of the number of economically disadvantaged students.
  - Ms. Walsh stated the area is very transient and so the foundation cannot continue with so much movement. She stated the local LEA offers so many different magnet schools and

parents can apply to those, but what she has seen is that those schools are not fully implemented and funded to do it correctly.

- Mr. Machado stated the EDS population projected is over 50% but they have no weighted lottery plans so he wonders how they plan to ensure that number. Mr. Machado would like to know why they choose to teach math in the afternoon.
  - Ms. Taylor stated they want to do the lottery, but with the first year they want to see how they do. She stated they are doing well with interest.
- Dr. Eldridge asked if Ms. Taylor will be the principal. She stated yes, and she will be replaced on the board.
- Dr. Haire asked how the organization chart works. Ms. Taylor stated she would be the lead principal. Dr. Haire asked if there is also an instructional leader. Ms. Taylor stated yes.
- Dr. Haire asked if they have an agreement with the local LEA to provide lunches. Ms. Thomas stated yes.
- Mr. Dantzler stated that they are working with a company to find a facility. He spoke about property with plumbing and slab and they have to work with the city to see if that would work.
- Mr. Friend asked about parental interest. Ms. Taylor spoke about interest forms received.

#### Closing Statement

- Ms. Taylor stated that she reviewed schools in the area and except one school, all schools were rated a “D.” She stated she believes they can help the students.
- Mr. Dantzler spoke about the passion of Ms. Taylor and her love for her children.
- Ms. Taylor stated the word Agape means love.

#### Deliberation

- Mr. Friend stated there is no doubt that the applicant is committed to the community. He continued he needs to learn more from the application, and we can only go by what they submit. He stated for example, the importance of social emotional learning but not see that in the budget, is a disconnect.
- Dr. Eldridge stated there is no counselor or social worker in all five years of the budget. He worries about the understanding of what is needed and that it shows in the budget. He stated it’s a heavy lift on teachers without support.
- Dr. Haire stated it sounds like a technicality, but the mission statement says it will offer rigorous classical curriculum, and that can be misleading for families. She stated perhaps they meant traditional because it’s not an actual classical curriculum.
- Dr. Bullard stated they are seeing that throughout the application. She stated there is a disconnect between the vision and the follow through and plans in the application.
- Dr. Stoops stated the district offers so many special schools, including a classical school, so the question becomes what is it that distinguishes the school from the county schools that offer specialized programs.
- Dr. Haire stated the evidence was not submitted to show adequate interest.
- Mr. Friend mentioned concerns with the budget they were unable to jump into such as the technology budget.
- Mr. Machado stated there is a need for choice in the area and just because the county is offering specialty programs, doesn’t mean they are doing well. He stated the size of the school makes him feel better about the application.

- Dr. Eldridge spoke about his experience at the district level and how he had to learn so much going into the charter world.
- Dr. Haire continued to express concerns about the application and the mission statement.
- Dr. Bullard reiterated the disconnect she sees in the application.
- CSAB discussed whether the application could change if the board was granted a second round.

**Motion: Dr. Stoops** moves to forward application to a second interview.

**Seconded By: Mr. Machado**

Discussion

- CSAB reiterated the importance of reaching out to families, reviewing application, and understanding any disconnect, and preparing well for the second round.

**Unanimous (TS, JE, SB, DM, BF, RH)**

Passed                      Failed

Alpha Schools of Excellence

Introduction

- Ms. Rackley gave an introduction on the school (located in Cumberland County). Stated the number of schools in the region as well as proposed subgroup and demographic data.

Opening Remarks

- Dr. Mark Davis gave the opening statement. He spoke about his passion for building a community school in the Littleton area. He stated there are not public schools in the community and only a private school.
- He continued that Halifax County is in need of more opportunities for students of all walks of life.
- Dr. Davis introduced the board members. Ms. Tiffany Shurland spoke about her experience in the mental health field. Other board members introduced themselves.

Questions/Discussion

- Mr. Friend asked about facility plans. He also has several questions about the budget and whether it supports the educational plan. He stated there is a counselor in year one but only one for the first five years and why not have more when considering high school needs.
  - Dr. Davis stated they looked into facilities in the area and mentioned a school building that was closed a decade ago in Littleton.
- Mr. Friend would like to know why no budget line for computers.
- Mr. Friend would like to know why the board is not in person.
  - Dr. Davis stated the board is spread out and a few connected to the area. He stated he is a land owner and his wife’s family is there.
  - Dr. Davis thought the in person interview was optional.
  - He stated he is in the Virginia area. He stated that there was political opposition after he started this process.
- Dr. Haire asked about resumes and information forms. She stated that since the application, some board members have left and we don’t have that information.

- Dr. Davis stated his wife is a doctoral candidate and thought it best that the board makeup is more reflective of the community and have the time for this process.
- Dr. Haire would like to know about parental interest.
  - Dr. Davis stated they have work to do to gauge that interest.
- Dr. Stoops stated that the county has one of the highest numbers of charter enrollment in the county and how would this school compete.
- Mr. Falkenbury stated the county is not growing its student population and it just received 50 million to build a new school.
- Mr. Machado also wanted to know why the board is not here and also wants clarification about KIPP involvement.
- Mr. Machado also wants to know what connections the board has to the community.
- Dr. Haire would like to know more about the ed plan and the budget.
  - Dr. Davis stated the budget was based on conversations among the board and they would need to have financial consultation to really understand how to fund the positions.
- Mr. Machado asked how they would have the staff to offer some of the classes like Mandarin. He would also like to know if some of the class requirements would make access difficult.
  - Dr. Davis stated they spoke about how the board wants to offer a unique program including foreign languages.

#### Closing statement

- Dr. Davis stated strong boards are an indication of strong schools. He spoke about the strengths of the board. He stated they have people that care about children and communities. He spoke about the 20% decline in enrollment and one of the lowest performing LEAs in the county.
- He spoke about ideas the board going forward.

#### Deliberation

- Mr. Machado stated he did not sense passion for a charter school in this location and could not figure out the connection to this community. He stated it could have been because they were remote, but he did not sense that.
- Mr. Falkenbury stated he was disappointed that no one appeared in person. He stated he is also not sure what the connection to the community is and why there aren't better representatives for the area on the board. He stated that there are brand new state of the art schools going into the area combined with the saturation of charter enrollment, there are several flags that this does not warrant a charter.
- Mr. Friend stated he will echo those comments. He stated that it was a miscalculation to not come in person and it was not a health reason.
- He continued that there is a lot in the application that is not developed in the budget. He stated this application is not ready. Mr. Friend stated the interest is not there.
- Dr. Stoops stated that is exactly it and the application discounts the fact that they would be drawing students from great distances.

**Motion:** Dr. Eldridge moves to not forward this application for approval.

**Seconded By:** Mr. Friend

#### Discussion

- Dr. Haire stated they may have a desire to make a difference and have good experience, and they may see needs in the area, but the application is still developing. She stated the board is still shifting and very busy and as Dr. Davis said, “spread out” and the town hall was sparsely attended.
- Dr. Haire also stated that Dr. Davis mentioned he needs financial consultation. She stated that this is something still in development and not prepared.

**Unanimous (TS, JE, SB, DM, BF, RH)**

Passed

Failed

**Renewals**

- Ms. Cook outlined the 3-year renewal category guidelines and stated that the schools in this box don’t fit the box well due to COVID data loss.

**Raleigh Oak Charter School**

- Ms. Cook talked about the basic student numbers as well as some school performance/grade data.
- Roxanne Bellamy introduced the mission of the school, introduced her board, and talked on the data/performance grade.
- Questions/Discussion
  - Mr. Machado asked about the restructured 5<sup>th</sup> grade schedule. Mr. Barry came up and outlined the new platform based on a majority of students who were behind in math and other subjects.
  - Mr. Eldridge asked what they thought led to teacher turnover. Ms. Bellamy thinks that it is because of individuals thought they were going to be going into a ‘free school’ and they left after being asked to follow NC requirements/standards.
  - Mr. Friend or Mr. Eldridge asked about the pay compared to Wake County. Mr. Barry mentioned it was above Wake County pay. Mr. Barry also mentioned that it is a struggle for all people to find qualified teachers.
  - Mr. Friend asked if they had any comments on the recommendation for a 3 year renewal. Ms. Bellamy stated that they are grateful the doors can continue to be open; but also believe they can shoot for a 5 year renewal because COVID really hurt them.
  - Dr. Haire asked what 2018 enrollment was; Ms. Bellamy didn’t know that and Ms. Baquero mentioned what data they had.
  - Mr. Friend talked about compliance issues and what they haven’t met so far. Asked about 2018 benchmark data because if it met certain qualifications then they would be 5 year renewal qualified. Ms. Baquero and Mr. Eldridge/Mr. Friend went back and forth on the data that was available as well as some of the other compliance issues they have found. Mr. Barry talked about remediation steps the board is taking
    - Mr. Machado asked for clarification. Mr. Barry mentioned that the audit company was submitted on time but the company failed to file on time and were granted an extension.
  - Mr. Eldridge mentioned they are thankful for the candidate and they – and Dr. Haire – believe they are on the right track to improvement.

**Moore Montessori Community School**

- Ms. Cook introduced the school and some of the demographic and academic data.
- Catherine Rucker – Board Director – introduced her board, and went over the school’s vision, plan, academic data, performance data and more.
- Questions and Discussion
  - Mr. Falkenbury asked what diagnostic they are using for Read to Achieve. Ms. Rucker answered this and stated it’s the same as the public schools in the area.
  - Mr. Machado asked if they were 1 point away from a ‘C’. Ms. Rucker said yes and they didn’t count their science scores. Mr. Machado congratulated and thanked Ms. Rucker for all she’s done.
  - Ms. Baquero went over the guidelines and outlined what was missing in this application to move it up to a 5-year renewal application.
  - Mr. Falkenbury asked if the math and the montesorri model makes it so it’s complicated to implement in their school. He cited nationwide statistics in math as well. Ms. Rucker acknowledged this and noted that grades are starting to turn the corner in their math scores.

#### Next Generation Academy

- Ms. Cook introduced the school and some of the demographic and academic data. Also noted the compliance issues and financial issues.
- Sam Misher introduced his board, went over the school’s plan, academic data, challenges, performance data and more.
- Questions and Discussion
  - Mr. Machado congratulated the board but was concerned about the 15% lower marks than the Guilford County Schools and the African American students. Mr. Misher touched on the growth score as well as the need to improve growth of the students. He also stated that a lot of the students he receives come in with very large amounts of deficiencies in their performance.
  - Mr. Eldridge asked where the school was located to which Mr. Misher replied. Mr. Eldridge complimented the school and the board based on the location.
  - Ms. Someone (Couldn’t tell by voice) talked about the Growth score and asked if it was EVAS score. Mr. Misher explained that score, and talked about how if the weights of that score were changed then they would consistently be an A school.
  - Dr. Haire reiterated the need to focus on growth as it would boost proficiency later and asked when the school opened. Mr. Misher replied that it has seen consistent growth from 2018-2022.

#### Apprentice Academy of North Carolina

- Ms. Cook introduced the school and presented some of the demographic and school performance data.
- John Dedra and Dr. Barry Ross came up and presented information on the school. They introduced their board, went over the school’s plan, touched on performance data and grades as well as the challenges they are currently facing. Mr. Dedra began talking about the sewer issue in Union County and the lack of a facility.
- Questions and Discussion
  - Mr. Friend asked about why they recommended a 7-year renewal for their school when they don’t fit the qualifications. Mr. Dedra compared his school to other schools that got 7 year and 10-year distinctions. Mr. Friend clarified the distinction, touched on statutory

requirements for those levels and guidelines for them as well. Mr. Dedra and Mr. Friend had a conversation about their data and their qualifications.

- Mr. Machado asked if he agrees that the school doesn't fit 7-year qualifications. Asked how many board members to which Mr. Dedra said 8 and some are on the way here. Mr. Friend asked about the scheduling of 'A and B' calendar with Friday's off? Mr. Dedra answered that Friday's were remote learning days. Mr. Machado asked why they are moving out of a relatively new facility. Mr. Dedra said it was due to issues with the property owner / developer.
- Dr. Haire asked about a local competition to which Mr. Dedra responded that they had won a \$5,000 grant.

**Motion: Mr. Friend** motioned to adjourn 3:23PM

**Seconded By: Mr. Eldridge**

**Vote: Unanimous**

**Passed**

**Failed**