

**North Carolina Textbook Commission  
Deliberations and Reconsiderations Meeting  
Draft Minutes**

September 19, 2022  
9:00 a.m.

**Members Present:** Jodie Ray Autry, Rikki Baldwin, Maria Bishop, Shannon Brayboy, Karina Cameron, Ashton Copley, Jarrod Dennis, Monica Douglas, Melissa Jenkins, Kathleen Linker, Matthew McLean, Alicia Ray

**Members Absent:** Kathryn Bailey, Marlana Bleu, William Chesher, Aubrey Godette, Angela Martin, Susan Mills, Rob Orrill, Lindsey Sise

**Others Present:** Dr. Carmella Fair (NCDPI), Kenya Wallace (NCSU)

**Call to Order and Welcome**

**Roll Call:** Dr. Carmella Fair did the roll call

**Approval of Minutes**

**NOTE: There was no audible sound until 51:04 when the deliberations began with the bid for Cengage Learning Inc.**

**Cengage Learning Inc.**

**CGL7100**

Commissioner Autry - The materials represented 80% of the standards the content was appropriate for the grade.

Commissioner Baldwin - Good resource. It did match the standards. However, the text was too small. It was weak on vocabulary.

Commissioner Ray - The text promotes active student engagement through a field journal which encourages students to complete written responses with real world connections to link their background knowledge. However, the writing can become a challenge for some of our EC and EL students.

**Vote - Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

### **CGL7101**

Commissioner Linker - It did meet the standards 85%. Partnership with National Geographic is the primary source of documents along with videos, maps and real world examples.

Commissioner Baldwin - This would be a difficult source for EC Teachers. There are not a lot of speaking activities.

**Vote - Yay - 11 - Nay - 0**

### **CGL7102**

Commissioner Ray - It does meet the standards . Assortment of primary and secondary sources. The world religion information is a bit static and outdated. Not a lot of interaction with the text

Commissioner ? - This did cover 80%. It had topical assessments that were present.

**Vote - Yay - 10 Nay - 1**

### **CGL7103**

Commissioner Linker - 65% of the standards were met. The focus is from 1877 and over. But it does not address American history prior .

Commissioner Ray - Great document based questions past 1877 . Because it does not meet the content prior to 1877 it does not meet the 80% threshold. It does include some great profiles on some significant figures in history.

Commissioner Autry - (not audible)

**Vote – Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

### **eDynamic Learning**

#### **EDL7100**

Commissioner Linker - It meets 60% of the standards. They only address the personal finance standards.

**Vote - Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**EDL7101**

Commissioner Baldwin - It was a game role simulation like SIM city. The tutorial was well done . All units were not activated.

Commissioner Autry - (comment barely audible)

**Vote - Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**Exploros Inc.****EXP7100**

Commissioner Ray - This meets over 90% of the standards. It's appropriate for the grade level and the course. There are interactive lessons and the text encourages critical thinking. The graphic organizers discussions and scenarios for acting allow the students to internalize the content in various ways.

Commissioner ? - Response not audible

**Vote - Yay - 11 Nay -0**

**EXP7101**

Commissioner Baldwin - There were ample opportunities to construct responses for formative and summative tasks. Opportunity to show cause and effect.

Commissioner Linker - Covered 85% of the standards. Allowed for opposing perspectives including tasks.

Commissioner Autry - It was much stronger (remainder of comment not audible)

**Vote - Yay - 10 Nay - 1**

**EXP7102**

Commissioner Linker - It met 90% of the standards. It does follow the five formats. Very interactive, and it has hyperlinks that can be accessed for free.

**Vote - Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

## **Gibbs Smith Education**

### **GSE7100**

Commissioner Autry - Appropriate reading for 8th grade. Has assessment materials for teachers.

Commissioner Linker - It integrated with NC history standards.

**Vote - Yay - 10 Nay - 1**

### **GSE7101**

Commissioner Ray - Meets 90% of the curriculum. The major conflicts are addressed in chronological order. Multiple methods for assessment, instruction and differentiation are included.

Commissioner Brayboy - (Comment not audible)

Commissioner Baldwin - Difficult for students to access information.

**Vote - Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

**GSE7102** - There is a print and a digital only access edition

Commissioner Ray - Meets 90% of the standards. Excellent coverage of cultures across the ages and how they have impacted civilization in both good and bad ways. It heavily supports ELA standards. An area of concern for beginning teachers there is not a lot of background knowledge shared for beginning teachers that may need that additional support.

Commissioner Autry - (barely audible)

**Vote - Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

### **GSE7103**

Commissioner ? - not audible

Commissioner Linker - Meets standards and has a focus on North Carolina.

**Vote - Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

### **GSE7104**

Commissioner Baldwin - Offers multiple perspectives and checks for understanding. It did meet the objectives.

Commissioner Brayboy - Native Americans were portrayed as currently living in our society.

Commissioner Ray - Does an excellent job with the inquiry content and standards.

**Vote - Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

### **Goodheart-Wilcox**

#### **GWP7100**

Commissioner Linker - It met 90% of the standards. Provided opportunities for collaborating teams joined together and schools will have resources for explorations. It would be helpful to include information about the cost of secondary education.

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

### **Houghton Mifflin Harcourt**

#### **HMH 7100**

Commissioner Linker - It met the standards. I liked the partnership with the district channels

Commissioner Autry - (comment not audible)

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

#### **HMH 7101**

Commissioner Ray - It meets over 90% of the standards. The resource is literature based and met the criteria to focus on bringing the skills across the curriculum in the Social Studies classroom. The resource addresses all major historical events and focuses on bringing details to connect each of those events.

Commissioner Baldwin - The videos were very engaging. The primary sources were well thought out for different learning styles. It had different activities that were easy to use.

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

#### **HMH 7102**

Commissioner Ray - The focus is more on the old NC Standards rather than the updated curriculum. Missing several civic and government standards including 2.4, 3.4, 3.6, 4.1, and 4.3

Commissioner Linker - Found by the importance as far as the 1.15 (comment not clear)

Commissioner Autry - (not audible)

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

### **HMH 7103**

Commissioner Ray - Great information on the US Supreme Court Cases and the Federal Court System. It does not meet 80% of the standards. It is missing multiple standards. All of Behavioral Sciences, all of Economics, all of History. Civics and Government 1.1, 2.1, 2.3, 2.4, 3.1, 3.2, 3.3, 3.4, and 3.6, 4.1, 4.3, 4.4 and 4.6

Commissioner Linker - (not audible)

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

### **HMH 7104**

Commissioner Autry - This bid especially with the additional digital resources covers all the concepts including the skill literature.

Commissioner Linker - Provides for EL learners.

**Vote: Yay - 10 Nay - 1**

### **HMH 7105**

Commissioner Linker - Met 89% of the standards.

Commissioner Autry - (not audible)

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

### **inquirED**

### **INQ 7100**

Commissioner Autry - It did not quite meet the 80%.

Commissioner Linker - Some of the sources are accessible and a portion of their elementary material do reference epic books as an external source

Commissioner Ray - Books being available in Epic. Some of those resources would not be available for some of the districts in our state. It does reference using other grade level textbooks to cover part of the curriculum which may not be as accessible for teachers within their school.

Commissioner Baldwin - They did provide videos but it still lacked some standards.

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

### **INQ7101**

Commissioner Linker - It did not meet 80% of the standards. The videos are translated in Spanish.

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

### **INQ7102**

Commissioner Ray - It does meet the 80% threshold of NC objectives. The history concepts are covered well. There are culturally diverse innovators shared and the inquiry studies are well met.

Commissioner Autry - It was very inquiry-based.

**Vote: Yay - 9 Nay - 2**

### **INQ7103**

Commissioner ?

Commissioner Baldwin - It was very confusing about the standards coordination. The standards would reference back to another grade level. It would be a hard program for a new teacher to incorporate into their class.

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

### **INQ 7104**

Commissioner Linker - I found that it only met 60% of the standards and strong in the inquiry standards. Does not align to the NC standards specifically.

Commissioner Autry - This would be a great supplemental resource for teachers.

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

### **INQ7105**

Commissioner Baldwin - I appreciated the format of the text, however, it did not cover half of the standards. Would not recommend it for being the primary book in the classroom. It could be a supplement.

Commissioner Ray - This text is missing 5.b, 1.1, 1.2. All of Economics, Geography 1.3 and the history standards are only met up to the American Revolution.

**Vote: Yay - 1 Nay - 10**

### **Lexia Learning**

#### **LLS 4000**

Commissioner Ray - This appears to be another k-6 bundle. It does not meet 80% of each of the grade levels.

Commissioner Linker - It does not have a lot of opportunities for reading and writing particularly in Social Studies and Science. It does not meet the individual grade levels. It is very cultural diverse and has placement tests that make it easy to digitally educate students.

Commissioner Baldwin - It could be a complicated text for the earlier readers, specifically the first grade.

Commissioner Autry - (not clear)

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

### **Social Studies School Services**

#### **SSS7100**

Commissioner Linker - Met the standard course of studies requirements, from concrete to abstract. The material was not biased; it represented all races and had



iconic characters. It provided for cooperative brain forming learning. Some of the digital content had read-aloud options and some did not.

Commissioner Autry - It met 100% of the standards.

Commissioner Baldwin - It did contain the 4 language domains. There was read-aloud but not every topic.

Commissioner ? (not very clear)

**Vote: Yay - 10 Nay - 1**

### **SSS7101**

Commissioner (not clear)

Commissioner Ray - Moving past the fictitious world and connecting to the real world would be very important as they move throughout their education. I appreciated this content and the information that was provided. I would have liked to see it connecting to the students' real world rather than the fictitious world.

Commissioner Autry - (unclear)

**Vote: Yay - 8 Nay - 3**

### **SSS7102**

Commissioner ? (unclear)

Commissioner Baldwin - It did cover the 4 language domains. It had opportunities for acceleration and remediation. It did not include specific people or events. It would be difficult to translate to Spanish.

Commissioner Ray - The geography and maps are strong in this resource. There are many opportunities for inquiry. It is missing multiple perspectives of historical events and how those events may have affected different populations in different ways.

**Vote: Yay - 8 Nay - 3**

### **SSS7103**

Commissioner Linker - It met the standards. It was not a lot that was specific to NC. and in the 3rd grade you are really starting to look at where we are as a state. 90% of the pictures and information were from other states and Canada. There were some inaccuracies regarding native americans and indigenous people that could be offensive. Example: Indians do not have Teepees in NC. That would be

the plains tribes so that is a representation that is stereotypical of our indigenous population.

Commissioner Autry - It did meet the standards but it was pretty generalized.

**Vote: Yay - 2 Nay - 9**

#### **SSS7104**

Commissioner Ray - Met at least 80% of the NC Standards. The projects at the end of each chapter are inquiry based and collaborative. I was glad that it did mention the Greensboro Four and the landfill site in Warren County. It was missing E1.1 , 2.2 and H1.6.

Commissioner Baldwin - Several trackers were outside of the standards. Missing areas such as personal finance and income.

**Vote: Yay - 7 Nay - 4**

#### **SSS7105**

Commissioner Linker - It did meet the standards. The information was after the civil war period.

Commissioner Autry - (unclear)

**Vote: Yay - 2 Nay - 9**

Commissioner Linker noted that for the Middle School Submission we have 4 different bid submission numbers for each grade 6, 7 and 8th. It is the same material. It is just a license thing. They will need to vote for each because they are individual submissions.

#### **SSS7106**

Commissioner Autry - There were misspelled words.

Commissioner Baldwin - It did offer supplemental materials but it did have a lot of errors in the text and lacked plexity.

Commissioner Ray - It does not meet 80% requirements. There were multiple inquiry objectives that were not covered. As well as B1.2, 1.3, CNG 1.4, 1.6, E1.1, 1.2, G2.2, 2.4 and H1.2 and 1.3.

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7107**

Commissioner Autry - Same comment as the previous bid. Ex: Students were asked to create a brief short paragraph and then fill-in the links in a new paragraph that was very similar.

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7108**

No Discussion

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7109**

No Discussion

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7110**

Commissioner Linker - It did not meet 69% . There were no primary sources and was not inquiry based.

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7111**

Commissioner Autry - Same Comments  
Commissioner ? (not clear)

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7112**

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7113**

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7114**

Commissioner Linker - It only met 68% of the standards. It was missing the geography and history standards. It had a lot of spelling and grammatical errors in the text. Hard to make connections between the contents.

Commissioner Brayboy: Some of the chronology was wrong and left a lot of gaps.

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7115**

Commissioner ? - There were misspellings.

Commissioner Baldwin - No key words were provided. There were good activities but it was a difficult resource to use. It had grammatical errors and too simplistic

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7116**

No Discussion

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7117**

No Discussion

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7118**

Commissioner Ray - This text does not meet 80% of the standards. The real play exercises ask students to take stances but they rarely create authentic opportunities for students to take informed action.

Commissioner Linker - (most of comment was unclear)

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

Commissioner Linker noted this for High School. There will be 4 bids for each course with the same material. The only difference is the license.

**SSS7119**

No Discussion

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay- 11**

**SSS7120**

No Discussion

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7121**

No Discussion

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7122**

Commissioner Ray - A strength is the interactive features of the history mysteries and the math activities. However it does not meet the criteria due to a lack of depth within the content.

Commissioner Autry - A strength was the materials and supplemental resources.

**Vote: Yay - 1 Nay - 10**

**SSS7123**

No Discussion

**Vote: Yay - 1 Nay - 10**

**SSS7124**

No Discussion

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay- 11**

**SSS7125**

No Discussion

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7126**

Commissioner Ray - It does a good job with primary and secondary sources. Comparing governments around the world is examined multiple times. However, it only meets 67% of the standards.

Commissioner Linker - It's not North Carolina specific.

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7127**

Commissioner Autry - Same comments from previous bid.

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7128**

Commissioner Baldwin - There is a disparity between the teacher resource and the student resource and no direct tie to North Carolina.

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7129**

No Discussion

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7130**

Commissioner Autry -

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7131**

No Discussion

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7132**

No Discussion

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**SSS7133**

No Discussion

**Vote: Yay - 0 Nay - 11**

**Savas Learning Company, LLC**

**SVL7100**

Commissioner ? -

Commissioner Ray - The 80% threshold was met. The resource in which they celebrate their state does not have North Carolina represented.

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

**SVL7101**

Commissioner Baldwin - It did meet the standards. The pictures were diverse and it gave examples for EL Learners. Resources were also able to be translated into Spanish.

Commissioner Autry - Materials allowed for students to experience activities in several ways.

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

**SVL7102**

Commissioner Ray - It does meet more than 95% of the curriculum requirements. It shows contributions of various minority groups that have impacted American history.

Commissioner Linker - Provides distance learning for virtual and in-person.

Commissioner Autry -

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

**SVL7103**

Commissioner ? -

Commissioner Baldwin - Although the 4 domains for EL Learners were present it was not as interactive as the previous book. The American Indian info was inaccurate . 99% of the book covers states and Canada.

Commissioner Linker - The history was not linked.

**Vote: Yay - 2 Nay - 9**

**SVL7104**

Commissioner Ray - The geography is well covered and the book is in chronological order through reconstruction but does not include anything from the wars of the 20th Century and beyond. There is a wide variety of forms of content, activities and assessments.

Commissioner Linker - It did meet 80% of the threshold.

**Vote: Yay - 2 Nay - 9**

**SVL7105**

Commissioner ?

Commissioner Baldwin - It seemed to be based on the old Social Standards rather than the new ones. But it did meet all of the standards.

Commissioner Autry -

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

**SVL7106**

Commissioner Linker - It did meet the standards. Primary and secondary resources. Lots of active engagement for the students.

Commissioner ?

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

**SVL7107**

Commissioner Ray - It has some great information about the US and even some state information as a whole but limited information about North Carolina specifically.

Commissioner Baldwin - User friendly and the graphics are great. Engaging for EC learners.

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

**SVL7108**



Commissioner Linker - It was good about connecting current events with past events. There were some technical glitches. It does not allow you to speak and say.

Commissioner Autry - It did meet 80% of the resources.

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

### **SVL7109**

Commissioner Linker - It only met 64% of the standards.

Commissioner Autry -

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

### **SVL7110**

Commissioner Linker - It does meet 64% of the standards. Personal Finance was not met.

Commissioner Ray - Eventhough the personal finance was not met, the Economics portion was well done. It does have read-aloud features.

**Vote: Yay - 1 Nay - 10**

## **Studies Weekly**

### **SWK7100**

Commissioner Ray - The material is colorful and engaging. The program begins with 4 weeks of inquiry made specifically for North Carolina. However, how inquiry standards are focused around compelling questions.

Commissioner Baldwin -

Commissioner Linker - At the end of each lesson ?

Commissioner Autry -

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

### **SWK7101**

Commissioner Baldwin - The text was appropriate for grade level and it was aligned to the standards and strong cultural representation.

Commissioner Autry - It would benefit from additional courses and inquiries.

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

**SWK7102**

Commissioner ?

Commissioner Linker - Liked how Social Studies was integrated with the EL Standards. It also had cultural diversity.

**Vote: Yay - 11 Nay - 0**

**SWK7103**

Commissioner Linker - Met 80% of the standards.

**Vote: Yay - 9 Nay - 2**

**SWK7104**

Commissioner ?

Commissioner Baldwin - Economics did not align with the standards. The perspectives were not diverse and outdated. It was an easy platform.

**Vote: Yay - 1 Nay 10**

**SWK7105**

Commissioner Ray - It does meet 80% of the standards. The correlation guide mentions how the national symbols were created but not the significance of those symbols.

Commissioner Linker - It did meet the standards but there was a lack of text complexity. The assessments were lower level. Limited opportunity for critical thinking applications.

Commissioner Autry -

**Vote: Yay - 6 Nay - 5**

**Adjournment:** Meeting adjourned at 12:06 p.m. Commissioner Autry made a motion for the meeting to adjourn and Commission Baldwin 2nd the motion. All commissioners in attendance approved.

**Minutes taken by:** Audrey M. Long

**Date of Approval:**