

**Minutes of the  
North Carolina Charter School Advisory Board  
Education Building  
301 N. Wilmington Street  
Raleigh, NC 27601-2825  
December 8, 2016**

Attendance/NCCSAB	Alan Hawkes- <i>Absent</i> Joseph Maimone Phyllis Gibbs- <i>Absent</i> Sherry Reeves Mike McLaughlin Cheryl Turner Hilda Parlér	Alex Quigley Eric Sanchez Tammi Sutton Becky Taylor – <i>Absent</i> Tony Helton Steven Walker
Attendance/SBE/DPI	<i>Office of Charter Schools</i>  Dave Machado, Director Deanna Townsend-Smith, Assistant Director Cande Honeycutt, Consultant Shaunda Cooper, Consultant Kebbler Williams, Consultant Brian Smith, Consultant	<i>SBE</i> Martez Hill  <i>Attorney General</i> Laura Crumpler Tiffany Lucas  <i>SBE Attorney</i> Katie Cornetto

**CALL TO ORDER**

The North Carolina Charter School Advisory Board (CSAB) meeting was called to order at 9:00 am by Chairman Alex Quigley who read the Ethics Statement and CSAB Mission Statement. Mr. Steven Walker led the Pledge of Allegiance.

The question was asked if there were any conflicts of interest with respect to any matters coming before the board. **Ms. Hilda Parlér recused herself from any discussion or voting regarding High Point Charter School. Mr. Walker recused himself from any discussion or voting regarding Union Preparatory Academy-Weddington.**

**Mr. Walker made a motion to approve the minutes from the October and November CSAB meetings. Mr. Joseph Maimone seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**

**APPLICATION UPDATES**

- Dr. Deanna Townsend- Smith, Assistant Director, Office of Charter Schools (OCS), led the discussion regarding current updates for the 2016 application process.

- The CSAB conducted one hour interviews for applicants proposing to open in 2018. Dr. Townsend-Smith provided a brief overview of each applicant summarizing the external evaluator comments in each evaluation rubric. Additionally, OCS provided details on each applicant's proposed location, grade levels served, enrollment numbers, LEA impact statements, and due diligence reports.

#### West Lake Preparatory Academy

- Mr. Maimone commented he was surprised the board has only been meeting for 5 months; however, the board's background and knowledge is impressive. Ms. Turner commented she was impressed with the board's ability to think through knowing their community and needs. **Mr. Helton expressed that since the school is partnering with CSUSA and replicating a B school that he recommends that the CSAB move to send to the SBE for approval. Mr. Walker seconded as the board has a firm and basic understanding of the education that has worked in other areas.**
- Additionally, Mr. Walker was impressed by the strength of the board and their ability to hold CSUSA's feet to the fire. Also, the answers to the budget and facility questions were great. Mr. Sanchez commented the board is energized and knowledgeable and his concern is a bigger issue that the board does not fully know its proposed plan. The board is diverse in profession but not in its make-up. Also, the transportation plan needs to be more proactive instead of reactive. However, there are no reservations of this group or board and encourages the CSAB to think about what is the general statement that we are making.
- **Mr. Maimone commented the group was prepared and asked that the motion be amended. The motion was withdrawn and restated stipulating approval was contingent on the nonprofit name being changed with sending the group to the SBE to begin Ready to Open. The foundation name must be changed by April 2017.** Mr. Quigley commented he was on the fence for the same reasons of Mr. Sanchez and wanted to hear from all CSAB members on the school. Ms. Turner shared the concerns as well but not in regards to this board. Ms. Parlér commented the board was strong in what they presented. Mr. Sanchez further detailed that the board presenting the application needs to know the plans they are presenting regardless of their chosen partner. Ms. Sutton expressed her concerns with the applicant group moving forward. **Motion passed 7 - 2 with Mr. Sanchez and Ms. Sutton dissenting.**

#### Union Preparatory Academy at Weddington

- Ms. Turner commented that the school should be replicating itself instead of Cardinal and the board is not ready to operate another school. Mr. Quigley expressed concerns with the school starting another one so soon and their current wait list was not extensive. Mr. Maimone

commented that the reason the school may have made the decision to expand so soon was because they have a grassroots connection and know the needs of the community.

- Ms. Turner concluded that diverting attention in year one is not a wise move. Ms. Sutton detailed that it may be beneficial for a school to get results as the first 2 years are critical. Ms. Reeves outlined the need argument provided by the applicant group was not strong. Mr. Quigley reiterated that another year may be beneficial. Mr. Maimone detailed his experience with opening a new school and the group is confident in their ability to start another school so soon. Ms. Sutton commented there is confidence and proof and she wants to vote on proof. Mr. Sanchez concluded that the applicant responses lacked depth and there are key red flags outlined in the application.
- Additionally, Mr. Sanchez recapped the information provided in the evaluation rubric. Also, Mr. Sanchez detailed that the responses to the targeted student population questions were concerning. Ms. Parlér commented the rush to replicate is concerning. Mr. Maimone gave the group tremendous credit on applying so soon and detailed the potential need in Union. Mr. Quigley stressed there is a value in having data for another year.
- Mr. Helton commented that not visiting Cardinal may have been a mistake for this proposed group. **Mr. Sanchez made a motion to not move Union Preparatory Academy at Weddington forward to Ready to Open Status. Ms. Turner seconded based on the board taking on more than it can handle.** Mr. Quigley suggested that the Principal from the school the board currently runs being present for an interview should the group apply again. Additionally, Mr. Quigley commented he is open to the school seeking fast track in the upcoming year and encouraged the CSAB to keep the motion clean. **The school will not move forward. Mr. Helton and Mr. Maimone dissented. Mr. Walker recused. The motion passed 6 to 2.**

### **EVERY STUDENT SUCCEEDS ACT PRESENTATION**

- The CSAB received an update on North Carolina's Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSA). Dr. Lou Fabrizio, Director, Data, Research, and Federal Policy, provided detailed information regarding the NC's ESSA plan to elicit feedback from the CSAB regarding charter school involvement.
- Any state receiving educational funds from the government must submit a state plan to the U.S. Department of Education (USDE). Guidance was needed on what was to be put in those state required plans. The USDE issued proposed draft regulations, and gave the public a certain amount of time to respond to those regulations. The USDE then posted them online to the Federal Registry the comments were received and what changes, if any, the USDE will make.

- The USDE's proposed draft regulation for accountability, data reporting and state plans, received over 20,000 comments.
- The biggest change as a part of the new law is the stakeholder engagement needed in the draft plan. Over 100 stakeholders are listed in the ESSA plan to elicit as much feedback as possible in the draft plan. The SBE passed a motion to delay the submission date for the state's plan until September 18, 2017.
- The ESSA plan serves as the state's draft application for funds authorized under ESSA and reflects current work by the state. Additionally, the plan addresses final used regulations and provisions of proposed regulations that are not final.
- The plan can be changed in the future and it does not dictate how funds are spent at the local level. The plan does not place limitations on the allowable use of federal funds beyond what is stated in the law.
- One challenge is identifying what indicators need to be in the new accountability model and determining how much weight should be given to each indicator. Double testing is another challenge that needs to be addressed before the final plan is submitted. The new federal law does allow the states to implement a procedure to eliminate double testing for students.
- Mr. Maimone stressed the need for flexibility and innovation options when developing the ESSA plan. It is important that alternative options are available. Local districts should be able to make the ultimate decision on the flexibility they want to use. Flexibility speaks to the innovation behind the charter movement.

### **POLICY UPDATES**

- **Mr. Maimone made a motion to amend the agenda to move the policy update portion scheduled for 3:45 pm up in the agenda to be addressed before the lunch break. Mr. Helton seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- The policy committee, led by Mr. Walker, led a discussion on a Charter Specific Alternative Charter School Policy for the CSAB to provide feedback.
- In a prior meeting, an alternative accountability policy for charter schools was discussed by the CSAB. The policy that covered all alternative schools was modified to add charter school criteria to that policy. While reviewing the update with the rules committee of the SBE, the committee asked the CSAB to remove the charter school portion and create a separate policy specifically for charter schools.

- Eligibility for charter school's inclusion in the Accountability Model as an alternative school is to be based on the following:
  - 1) The school serves students in grades 9-12, or serves students in a residential setting.
  - 2) A non-residential school applicant must have a high school component to be eligible to apply to use the Alternative School Accountability Model.
  - 3) At least three-fourths of the schools' population, i.e., 75% of students, are at risk as defined in GCS-Q-001. I.B. of academic failure and must exhibit one or a combination of the following descriptors:
    - a) involved in the juvenile justice system: b) returned from juvenile justice settings or mental health treatment facilities: or c) suspended or dropped out from traditional schools.
- As it relates to eligibility, a situation may arise where a student at a traditional school may go to a principal wanting to drop out. The principal may then suggest alternative options to deter the student from dropping out. To cover the above situation, Mr. Walker suggested that eligibility requirement 3(c) be changed to "suspended, dropped out, **or is likely to drop out** from traditional schools."
- Ms. Reeves questioned if that specific requirement is for traditional schools only, or should it be changed to reflect any and all schools. Ms. Turner expressed her concern that adding "likely to drop out" may act as an incentive to students and give more leeway with defining their reason behind dropping out of a school.
- **Mr. Walker then asked to address the policy issue at the December 9<sup>th</sup> meeting due to the discussion with the CSAB taking longer than the allotted time on the agenda.**

### **STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION UPDATES**

- The CSAB received an update on past and pending items recommended to the SBE for approval. Mr. Brian Smith, Education Consultant, OCS, presented these items to the CSAB.
- Charlotte Lab is requesting a weighted lottery for their K-5 campus. They would like to intentionally increase their population of economically disadvantaged students. Their goal is to improve their socioeconomic diversity to closely align with the Local Education Agency (LEA) and county demographics. The school has requested an amendment to the lottery procedure, beginning with the 2017 admission cycle, to reserve a portion of their seats for students who are economically disadvantaged. **Discussion regarding Charlotte Lab's request was postponed until the December 9<sup>th</sup> meeting.**

- Girls Leadership Academy of Wilmington (GLOW) is requesting a weighted lottery for grade six. Applications from students who are not meeting their targeted demographics impacts their ability to adhere to the school's mission and vision. GLOW requested that 80% of their targeted population are students who qualify for the National Free and Reduced Lunch program.
- **Mr. Quigley made a motion to recommend GLOW's amendment request to the SBE pending the legal department's approval. Ms. Reeves seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **Discussion on the 18 schools requesting increased enrollment requests was postponed until the December 9<sup>th</sup> meeting.**
- Discovery Charter School is a school in its planning year requesting enrollment greater than projections in its original application. The Charter Agreement section 7.4(a) states that during the first two years of the initial charter, the state will fund the school up to the maximum projected enrollment for each of those years as set forth in the application. However, in subsequent years, the school may increase their enrollment, only as permitted by charter school statute.
- In its original application, Discovery Charter School stated it would open with 200 students and grow to 480 students over four years. The school now requests to open with 352 students and grow to 528 over two years. The increase in student enrollment provides Discovery an opportunity to receive funding to prevent using temporary buildings, as stated in their application, and provide a permanent building initially. Overall, this action is financially beneficial to the school.
- Mr. Carl Forsyth, Board Chair, Discovery Charter School, provided an explanation on Discovery's plans to achieve the increased student enrollment and the financial progress the school can make with the amendment change.
- **Ms. Reeves made a motion to recommend Discovery's amendment request to the SBE. Mr. Helton seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**

### **SCHOOL UPDATES**

- Mr. Dave Machado, Director, OCS, provided a summary to the CSAB regarding Kestrel Heights Charter School.
- In October, the OCS received a letter from Kestrel Heights' attorney, detailing the school's discrepancy with its graduation requirements. Initially, eight students were discovered to have not met graduation requirements. After an internal investigation was completed, the number

increased to 22. A meeting was later facilitated between OCS, Kestrel Height and other NCDPI divisions.

- Mr. Brandon Paris, Board Chair, Kestrel Heights, led the discussion by introducing the members of the board and detailing their professional backgrounds. Mr. Paris stressed the belief that the diversity and tenure balance of the board allows the vision and oversight to ensure Kestrel continues to provide quality education to its students.
- Dr. Mark Tracy, Executive Director, Kestrel Heights, explained in detail the plan to resolve the issues that surfaced regarding the discrepancies with the graduation requirements. Dr. Tracy explained that the issues are centered on the graduation transcripts. Once the discrepancies in the transcripts were brought to his attention in June 2016, the staff immediately took action to resolve the problem. Twenty-one out of the twenty-two students affected by the discrepancies were contacted and the school is diligently working with the students to address the situation. Currently, Kestrel has not heard from any graduates about any issues with their transcripts.
- Ms. April Goth, High School Principal, Kestrel Heights, started in June 2016. Her first responsibility was to develop a master schedule for rising students. While completing the schedule, she identified several concerns while determining student graduation eligibility. After Dr. Tracy communicated the incident regarding the transcripts, Ms. Goth started evaluating the transcript discrepancies.
- Mr. Walker asked for clarification on the issue involving the transcripts at the school, specifically, was an audit conducted for the graduating classes prior to the 2016. Dr. Tracy explained that the primary focus was on the 22 students who graduated in 2016. A preliminary review was initiated for the 2014 and 2015 graduating classes. For the 2015 class, fifteen students were affected. The review also revealed sixteen students were impacted in 2016.
- Mr. Quigley questioned the rationale behind why the school did not move faster and more aggressively in the beginning to rectify the issue. Dr. Tracy explained that in hindsight, staff should have moved a little faster. One component that delayed action was gathering accurate information to fully understand the scope and significance of the problem. Another component was the back and forth communication with OCS and waiting feedback on next steps. Mr. Paris commented that once the school realized that it was not OCS' responsibility to provide specific direction rectifying the problem, the process started to reevaluate the plan of action. Multiple meetings were held to determine the best course of action.
- Mr. Helton questioned if any process existed to evaluate if students had the correct number of courses to graduate. Dr. Tracy explained that the school used PowerSchool, a system that outlines if each student has the necessary requirements to graduate. Dr. Tracy further explained that the previous counselor overrode the PowerSchool system to reflect courses as complete so the students would be eligible to graduate.
- Mr. Helton asked if the student truly earned a diploma, as set by the state of North Carolina, or if they were handed a transcript simply stating that they had completed the courses. Dr. Tracy

explained that some students did receive diplomas, with a graduation date listed, but had not met the graduation requirements that are mandated by the state.

- Ms. Reeves stressed the need for Kestrel to investigate all of its graduation classes to see if there are additional students that may have been affected.
- Mr. Maimone raised concerns about students who may be impacted who are currently enrolled in college. Mr. Paris explained that when the university requested transcripts from the school to enroll, the school submitted transcripts stating that met required courses needed for admittance to the university. Mr. Paris further explained that no student currently enrolled in a university has contacted Kestrel with any issues regarding current enrollment based on the transcripts sent by Kestrel.
- As it relates to the plan of action, Dr. Tracy explained that all students have been contacted with an explanation as to what was discovered in June 2016. Secondly, Kestrel has offered two different distinctions to the students affected, either a future core designation, or a Kestrel Heights designation. For the students who want to have a Future Core Ready designation for their transcripts, and are currently enrolled in a university, a course can be taken for a high school equivalency. Credit recovery and tutoring for demonstrated mastery options have also been offered for those who are seeking a Future Core Ready designation.
- Kestrel is in the process of making an amendment to their charter to address a change in their curriculum for the Kestrel Heights designation. Ms. Turner asked for further explanation on the Kestrel Heights designation. Dr. Tracy explained that the designation would allow the school to graduate students with 22 credit hours, but not necessarily the ones required by the state. Ms. Turner asked if a public school even had the option to graduate a class with credit hours less than what is required by the state. Ms. Turner further asked that if the Kestrel Heights designation is not a viable option, what will happen to the students affected by the transcript discrepancies. Dr. Tracy explained that it will be a case by case scenario because every student and their courses were impacted differently.
- Mr. Quigley explained that the CSAB will need to consult with their attorneys in closed session. Any recommendations from the CSAB will not be made until the December 9<sup>th</sup> meeting.
- **Mr. Quigley made a motion for the CSAB to go in to closed session to consult with legal counsel. Ms. Reeves seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **The CSAB members discussed with their attorney attorney-client privileged matters involving Kestrel Heights Charter School's graduation practices and course requirements. Mr. Walker moved to adjourn closed session and return to open session. Mr. Maimone seconded. CSAB returned to open session. No further business was conducted.**
- **The meeting adjourned via acclamation at 4:05pm**



**Minutes of the  
North Carolina Charter School Advisory Board  
Education Building  
301 N. Wilmington Street  
Raleigh, NC 27601-2825  
December 9, 2016**

Attendance/NCCSAB	Alan Hawkes- <i>Absent</i> Joseph Maimone Phyllis Gibbs- <i>Absent</i> Sherry Reeves Mike McLaughlin Cheryl Turner Hilda Parlér	Alex Quigley Eric Sanchez Tammi Sutton Becky Taylor – <i>Absent</i> Tony Helton Steven Walker
Attendance/SBE/DPI	<i>Office of Charter Schools</i>  Dave Machado, Director Deanna Townsend-Smith, Assistant Director Cande Honeycutt, Consultant Shaunda Cooper, Consultant Kebbler Williams, Consultant Brian Smith, Consultant	<i>SBE</i> Martez Hill  <i>Attorney General</i> Laura Crumpler Tiffany Lucas  <i>SBE Attorney</i> Katie Cornetto

**CALL TO ORDER**

The North Carolina Charter School Advisory Board (CSAB) meeting was called to order at 8:34 am by Chairman Alex Quigley who read the Ethics Statement and CSAB Mission Statement. Mr. Quigley led the Pledge of Allegiance.

The question was asked if there were any conflicts of interest with respect to any matters coming before the board. **Ms. Hilda Parlér recused herself from any discussion or voting regarding Hillside Academy.**

**APPLICATION UPDATES/INTERVIEWS**

- The CSAB made recommendations on which applicants will be recommended to the State Board of Education for Ready-to-Open. The CSAB conducted one hour interviews for applicants proposing to open in 2018. OCS provided a brief overview of each applicant summarizing the external evaluator comments in each evaluation rubric. Additionally, Dr. Deanna Townsend-Smith provided details on each applicant's proposed location, grade levels served, enrollment numbers, LEA impact statements, and due diligence reports.

### Ronald Reagan Academy

- The CSAB determined the need was clear for this proposed school; however, more work was needed with the application. Mr. Quigley wants to be in the school's corner but feels more detail needs to be added to the plan. Mr. Walker detailed he researched the work of Dr. Chavis in California and read some of the details and communicated that the information should have been included in the application.
- Mr. Quigley further detailed that the teacher pipeline in Oakland and Robeson County are different and more work is to be done with the application. Additionally, he reinforced the need for successful charters in rural areas but this application needs another year as this application is not ready. Ms. Parlér stated her concern is state testing and how the students will ultimately not be prepared. Mr. Maimone urged the board to possibly apply under replication with more detail and the proposed body may be able to replicate. Additionally, he stressed more evidence is needed and it is critical for all board members to be present.
- Mr. Sanchez urged the board to present the proposal to experts and gather more advice. **Mr. Sanchez made a motion to not recommend Ronald Reagan to Ready to Open Status. Mr. Maimone seconded.** Ms. Reeves thanked the board for their passion and referenced the letter at UNC-P and encouraged the board to have a firm partnership with the school. Mr. Helton expressed his concern on waiting and commented the school may lose the leader it has recruited. He also detailed the experience of Dr. Chavis for the other CSAB members. Mr. Maimone wants the board to come back with their passion and a better plan. **The motion passed 8 - 2. Mr. Helton and Mr. Walker dissented.**

### Bonnie Cone Classical Academy

- Mr. Walker commented the proposed application is better than from the previous round. Mr. Maimone stated he opened a classical school and did not start with Free and Reduced Lunch or busing. Mr. Sanchez commented that being proactive is important with the pieces proposed in the application and the targeted student population.
- Mr. Quigley detailed the plan has not been thought through and this is disappointing given this is a second consideration for the applicant group. Mr. Sanchez stressed that the applicant group has not fully addressed in writing or in the interview an understanding of its proposed targeted student population.
- Mr. Helton questioned if the application should be thrown out for a bad answer and reinforced the lunch program offered at Mr. Maimone's school. Mr. Sanchez pointed to the writing detailed in the application which stressed the academic expectations for minority students will be lower.

Mr. Walker commented that the education plan is good and will work and has worked in other places.

- **Mr. Maimone made a motion to move the applicant group forward to Ready to Open. Mr. Helton seconded.** Mr. Sanchez concluded the education plan was much improved; however, he outlined that the application outlines what a group is to do. His biggest concern was the enrollment. He thinks the interview and the application are both important and the group caused him to lose confidence. Ms. Parlér commented she thinks the pros outweigh the cons. Ms. Turner thinks the education plan is fine and the school will be fine as they will not get the children they are targeting in the application. Mr. Quigley urges the school to work with the Office of Charter School to implement a weighted lottery if approved. **The motion passed 5 - 3. Ms. Turner, Mr. Quigley, and Mr. Sanchez dissented.**

### **VOYAGER CHARTER SCHOOL PRESENTATION**

- Mr. Doug Price, 6<sup>th</sup> grade science teacher, Voyage Academy, provided to the CSAB information about the core connections curriculum, a class that gives students real problems in a space to derive real solutions.
- A core connection teacher focuses on partnering with the four core classes; math, language arts, science and social studies. The teacher's responsibility is to look at each core curricula and combine parts from each core class to give them a real problem and work with the students to create a real solution.
- Core connection teachers have the privilege of watching the students grow and contemplate real world problems with developing solutions. Students understand the importance of research and collaboration in order to reach the best solutions. The entire process enables students to develop their own growth in education.
- The students in Mr. Price's class presented a PowerPoint presentation to the CSAB about a solution to the problem about what would happen if humans could not live on earth anymore and needed to relocate to different colonies. The students were tasked with creating a plan to propose to investors to get people to fund their properties and move to their specific colony on another planet.

### **STATE BOARD OF EDUCATION UPDATES**

- Discussion continued from the December 8<sup>th</sup> meeting regarding the amendment requests that would be recommended to the SBE for approval. Mr. Brian Smith, Education Consultant, OCS, led the discussion.

- **Before discussion began, Mr. Steven Walker made a motion to recommended Charlotte Lab's request for a weighted lottery to the SBE for approval. Mr. Helton seconded. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **As it relates to the 18 schools requesting grade enrollment expansion, Mr. Walker recommended to pull out Heritage Collegiate Leadership, Cabarrus Charter Academy, Excelsior Classical Academy and Eno River. Mr. Walker recommended these schools to be removed from the request because they did not meet the 90% requirement of their average daily membership (ADM) or they are a currently low performing school.**
- **Dr. Townsend-Smith mentioned that the statue states that a school can request to increase their enrollment in their second year of operation and Mallard Creek is in their first year of operation. Mr. Machado mentioned that Falls Lake Academy currently has Exceptional Children (EC) non-compliance issues. The CSAB agreed to add Mallard Creek to the list of schools not to recommend to the SBE and to postpone its voting on Falls Lake until more details emerged on its EC non-compliance issues.**
- **Mr. Walker made motion that the following schools be recommended to the SBE to approve their expansion request:**
  - **Pinnacle Classical Academy**
  - **The Institute for the Development of Young Leaders**
  - **Charlotte Secondary School**
  - **KIPP: Charlotte**
  - **Corvian Community School**
  - **Charlotte Lab School**
  - **Queen City STEM School**
  - **Northeast Academy of Aerospace and Advance Technologies**
  - **Bethany Community Middle School**
  - **Southern Wake Academy**
  - **Triangle Math and Science**
  - **Wilson Prep Academy**
- **Ms. Reeves seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **Mr. Walker made a motion to recommend to the SBE that the expansion request from Heritage Collegiate Leadership not be approved due to the school currently being designated as a low-performing school. Mr. Helton seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **Mr. Walker made a motion to recommend to the SBE that the expansion request from Cabarrus Charter Academy not be approved due to the school not meeting its 90% ADM requirement. Mr. Helton seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **Mr. Walker made a motion to recommend to the SBE that the expansion request from Excelsior Academy not be approved due to the school currently being designated as a low-**

performing school. Ms. Reeves seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with two abstentions.

- **Mr. Walker made a motion to recommend to the SBE that the expansion request from Mallard Creek STEM Academy not be approved due to the school not meeting their 90% ADM requirement. Ms. Reeves seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **Mr. Walker made a motion to recommend to the SBE that the expansion request from Eno River not be approved due to the school not meeting their 90% ADM requirement. Ms. Parlér seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- Pine Springs Classical Academy is currently within their one year-delay and are requesting to use their second ADM numbers. Mr. Helton and Mr. Maimone both recused themselves from any voting or discussion regarding Pine Springs. **Mr. Walker made a motion to recommend their request to the SBE for approval. Mr. Quigley seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with two abstentions.**
- Commonwealth Academy, Stewart Creek and Central Wake, all dropout prevention schools, are requesting to amend their charter to show teacher certification requirement be 50% instead of 100%. **Mr. Walker made a motion to recommend the amendment request to the SBE for approval. Mr. Maimone seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- Cardinal Charter in Knightdale, is requesting to be granted a second year delay due to difficulty securing a location in the town. **Mr. Walker made a motion to recommend the second year delay request to the SBE for approval. Mr. Maimone seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- After discussion with the OCS, it was determined that Falls Lake Academy has rectified their EC issues. Mr. Walker made a motion to recommend Falls Lake Academy expansion request to the SBE for approval. Ms. Parlér seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.

### **MOTION**

- **Mr. Quigley made a motion to go in to closed session to discuss some matters with DPI's legal counsel. Mr. Walker seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **The CSAB members discussed with their attorney, attorney-client privileged matters involving Kestrel Heights Charter School's graduation practices and course requirements. Mr. Walker moved to adjourn closed session and return to open session. Mr. Maimone seconded. CSAB returned to open session. Motion carried unanimously.**

### **SCHOOL UPDATES**

- The CSAB continued discussion surrounding the transcript discrepancies at Kestrel Heights School to determine what recommendations should be made to correct the issue.

- Ms. Parlér questioned where the responsibility falls with the errors that were made. Mr. Quigley states that based on the information, it seems to be an issue of negligence more so than willful intent.
- Mr. Helton stressed that it is important to get more details behind what happened. He further suggested that Kestrel be placed on immediate non-compliance.
- Kestrel is currently up for a 2017 renewal. Mr. Maimone suggested not considering the charter renewal until the CSAB is satisfied with the information provided by Kestrel. If a recommendation is not made, the school's charter could expire on June 30, 2017.
- Mr. Walker stressed the urgency behind rectifying the issue. An investigation needs to happen to determine if the discrepancies were a result of negligence or malicious intent. He further recommended to the SBE for the Durham County District Attorney to begin investigation to determine if any criminal activity occurred from the guidance counselor or the principal at Kestrel. If the principal or the guidance counselor had licenses, then an investigation needs to happen to determine if their license should remain active. Responsibility does not fall with the OCS or with DPI. The responsibility behind what occurred falls on Kestrel. The school needs to show more transparency to the OCS. Transcripts should be released to OCS. Additionally, Kestrel should demonstrate if an audit has been conducted for the graduating classes of 2008-16 to determine an exact number of students who have been affected by the discrepancies. The speed in which the students were contacted is discouraging to the CSAB.
- **Mr. Sanchez made a motion to reconsider the previous motion that was made to recommend Kestrel for a ten year renewal. Ms. Turner seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **Mr. Walker made a motion to include the following recommendations to the SBE:**
  - **Kestrel Heights conduct a full investigation behind what caused the issue and the steps taken to rectify the issue. The items that Kestrel should provide to the OCS are to include, but not limited to: transcripts, letters, notes and anything else to provide further transparency to the issue. These items are to be turned in to the OCS no later than January 3, 2017.**
  - **Kestrel Heights be immediately placed on a governance non-compliant status. They are to notify the OCS who the employees in question are and if they held a license to see if any further action needs happen.**
  - **Until further recommendation from the CSAB, the SBE will not consider any charter renewal of Kestrel Heights.**
  - **Refer this case to the Durham County District Attorney's Office to see if any criminal investigation is warranted.**

- **Ms. Reeves seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**

### **FINAL RENEWAL REVIEW/DECISIONS**

- The CSAB received updated information on schools with charters expiring June 2017 to make a final recommendations to the SBE. Ms. Shaunda Cooper, Education Consultant, led the discussion.
- Since the last meeting, the 2016 financial audits had not been received for Arapahoe Charter School, Grandfather Academy and Rocky Mount Preparatory; however there were no reports of inaccuracies from 2013-15 for each school. Also, Neuse Charter was elevated to financial disciplinary non-compliance status with the School Business since December 2015. The school was recommended for a ten year renewal.
- **Mr. Walker made a motion that the following schools be recommended to the SBE for the initial renewal recommendation proposed by CSAB:**
  - **Bridges Academy**
  - **Casa Esperanza Montessori**
  - **Charlotte Secondary**
  - **Chatham Charter**
  - **CIS Academy**
  - **Columbus Charter School**
  - **Exploris School**
  - **Eno River Charter School**
  - **Francine Delaney New School for Children**
  - **Grandfather Academy**
  - **Gray Stone Prep Academy**
  - **Guildford Prep**
  - **KIPP: Charlotte**
  - **Magellan Charter**
  - **Maureen Joy Charter**
  - **Mountain Discovery Charter**
  - **PreEminent Charter**
  - **Quality Education Academy**
  - **Sallie B. Howard**
  - **Sterling Montessori Academy**
  - **Summit Charter**
  - **The Carter G. Woodson School of Challenge**
  - **The Central Park Schools for Children**
  - **The Children's Village Academy**
  - **The Community Charter School**
  - **The Learning Center Charter School**
  - **Voyager Academy**

- **Wilmington Preparatory Academy**
- **After discussion with the CSAB, Mr. Walker later amended his motion to remove Voyager Academy from the list of schools to be recommended to the SBE. Mr. Maimone seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **Mr. Walker made a motion to recommend Arapahoe Charter for a ten year renewal, with stipulations that the audit comes back with no findings. Mr. Maimone seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **Mr. Walker made a motion to recommend Grandfather Academy for a ten year renewal, with stipulations that the audit comes back with no findings. Ms. Turner seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **Mr. Walker made motion to table any discussion regarding Kestrel Heights' renewal. Mr. Helton seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- Ms. Leigh Ann Kerr, Assistant Director, School Business Administration, explained that in 2015, the audit for Neuse Charter was submitted late and they were placed on probationary non-compliance due to insolvency, late submission and not requesting an amendment. Their 2016 was submitted in a timely matter. Neuse was elevated to disciplinary because for the second year in a row, there was an increased deficit in their unassigned governmental fund balance and an increased deficit in their total governmental balance that carried over to 2016.
- **Mr. Maimone made a motion to recommend Neuse charter for seven year renewal without stipulations. Mr. Walker questioned the difference with offering a seven or ten year renewal if they add financial stipulations for the school to meet. Mr. Walker moved to amend the motion to recommend Neuse Charter for a ten year renewal, with a stipulation of three years to produce a fund balance of \$400, 000. Mr. Walker's motion was not seconded. Ms. Parlér seconded Mr. Maimone's motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **Mr. Walker made a motion to recommend Rocky Mount Prep for a three year renewal, contingent on the audit coming back with no findings. Mr. Sanchez seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **Mr. Walker made a motion to recommend Voyage Academy for a ten year renewal with the stipulation that the audit comes back with no findings. Mr. Maimone seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously.**
- **The meeting adjourned via acclamation at 2:24 pm**